

DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE: MARCH 7, 2012

To: Chair Woollett and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager

FROM: Robert Garcia, Associate Planner

SUBJECT: DRC No. 4538-11 – SALEM LUTHERAN CHURCH & SCHOOL

SUMMARY

The proposed Salem Lutheran Specific Plan provides for a redesign of the church and school campus with a new worship center that includes a sanctuary, conference and meeting rooms, and administrative offices.

RECOMMENDED ACTION-RECOMMENDATION TO PC

Staff recommends the Design Review Committee (DRC) recommend approval of the proposal to the Planning Commission (PC), subject to conditions of approval contained in the staff report and any conditions that the DRC determines appropriate to support the required findings.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Salem Lutheran Church

Property Location: 6500 East Santiago Canyon Road

General Plan Designation: ESTR (Estate Low Density)

Zoning Classification: R-1-40 (Single-Family Residential)

Existing Development: Church and School

Property Size: 6.03 acres

Associated Applications: ZC NO.1259-11, SP No. SPLAN-0002 & ENV NO. 1827-11

Previous DRC Project Review: The DRC preliminarily reviewed DRC No. 4027-05 on May 17,

2006. The plan presented at that meeting proposed a 757 fixed-seat sanctuary and worship center of approximately 24,000 square feet, relocation of the preschool to the adjacent existing onsite vacant structure and parking for 200 vehicles on paved surface and 112 vehicles on the grass playfield when necessary. Since that time, the application was withdrawn and a new

formal application for a Specific Plan was submitted.

PUBLIC NOTICE

On February 16, 2012, the City sent a Notice of Availability (NOA) for the Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) for the Salem Lutheran Church and School Project and a Public Hearing Notice to all property owners/tenants within a 300-foot radius of the project site, person's specifically requesting notice, and the State Clearinghouse.

On February 27, 2012 it was discovered that the incorrect square footage of the proposed worship center had be used. A revised NOA was sent to all interested parties and will be renoticed in the newspaper. These changes do not affect the documents that were distributed for review and to solicit responses. The changes revise the incorrect square footage of the proposed worship center and expand the project description slightly in the NOA.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The City of Orange has determined that a DEIR is required to analyze the potential environmental impacts of the project. The DEIR has been prepared in accordance with CEQA and the CEQA Guidelines. The City of Orange will consider certification of the DEIR prior to taking action on the requested approvals. The public review period began on February 16, 2012 and would have ended on April 2, 2012. As a result of the changes to the NOA, the applicant has requested that the 45-day review period be extended. **The public review period extends to April 23, 2012.** Written comments must be received in the offices of the City of Orange Planning Division by 5:30pm on **April 23, 2012**.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The Salem Specific Plan provides for a redesign of the church and school campus with a new approximately 23,000 square foot worship center that includes a 712 seat sanctuary, conference/meeting rooms, the sacristy, offices, choir/music rooms, storage, childcare, and other ancillary/administrative rooms. In order to accommodate the new worship center, the existing 3,262 square foot sanctuary building and the existing 3,040 square foot preschool building will be demolished. The existing preschool will be relocated to the existing on site vacant structure (referred to as the "Fowler House" in the community). The preschool would be 5,981 square feet. No height increase to the existing vacant structure is proposed. The exterior façade will maintain its current characteristics. Seven classrooms are proposed, ranging in size from approximately 591 square feet to approximately 647 square feet. Each classroom will have its own storage and toilet room. Existing onsite infrastructure related to storm water and water quality management and improved vehicle circulation and parking design to improve the flow of traffic entering and exiting the site are also part of the redesign.

The existing K-8 classrooms are located in two classroom buildings. The applicant is not proposing any changes to the buildings through this application. The maximum student enrollment on campus and the maximum number of students allowed on campus at any one time will not change. The maximum student enrollment on campus is 726 students; however, per Conditional Use Permit No. 2213-98, Resolution No. 8974, approved by the City of Orange on July 14, 1998, the maximum number of students allowed on campus at any one time is 611.

The project Design Guidelines and Development Standards in the Specific Plan will be discussed in the Analysis/Statement of Issues Section within this report.

The applicant is requesting approval of the following entitlements:

Zone Change No. 1259-11. The proposal includes a request for a zone change to change the existing zoning classification on the entire project site from R-1-40 (Single-Family Residential) to the SP-PI (Specific Plan/Public and Institutional) to accommodate a specific plan.

Specific Plan No. SPLAN-0002. The proposal includes a request for a Specific Plan to provide a uniform set of development standards applicable to the entire site to implement the project. By pursuing this approach to the project, responsible redevelopment of the property can be ensured through the adoption of a development control mechanism through the Design Guidelines and Development Standards in the Specific Plan. The most suitable control mechanism for this project is the Specific Plan which serves both a planning and regulatory function. The Specific Plan, as such, contains the necessary standards, guidelines and procedures to implement the desired improvements to the Salem Lutheran Church property.

Design Review Committee No. 4538-11. The proposal includes a request for design review because the project includes the Design Guidelines and Development Standards in the Specific Plan for construction of new buildings, reconstruction of parking lots and the multipurpose field, and landscape improvements including construction of masonry walls. The project applicant proposes a DRC application for the proposed conceptual project elevations and landscape plan, reflective of the requirements of the proposed Salem Church and School Specific Plan. A subsequent DRC application would be submitted with the site plan review for the worship center.

Environmental Impact Report No. 1827-11. The City of Orange has determined that a DEIR is required to analyze the potential environmental impacts of the project. The DEIR has been prepared in accordance with CEQA and the CEQA Guidelines. The City Council will consider certification of the DEIR prior to taking final action on the requested approvals.

EXISTING SITE

The site is located within the boundaries of Orange Park Acres (OPA). The site consists of 4 Parcels on the south side of Santiago Canyon Road, the west side of Orange Park Boulevard, and the north side of Frank Lane. The rectangular shaped site contains 6.03 acres. The project site is currently developed with the Salem Lutheran Church and School. The church and school campus site is comprised of two classroom buildings, preschool, multipurpose building, grass multipurpose field, a sanctuary, and ancillary sporting facilities. Currently, regular church services are held in the multipurpose building with smaller services held within the sanctuary.

EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

Rural residential and equestrian-oriented developments characterize the immediate vicinity of the project site including the equestrian-oriented community of OPA. Land uses in the vicinity of the project include large lot single-family dwellings, recreational open space, urban development,

and undeveloped land. The Mara Brandman Horse Arena and retail flower and vegetable building are adjacent to the northwest site boundary. Residential uses are located along Frank Lane south of the site and to the west at the end of Frank Lane. A commercial rock crushing operation is located northwest of the project site across Santiago Canyon Road.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the DRC should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

1. Architectural Features.

- a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.
- b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.

2. Landscape.

- a. The type, size and location of landscape materials shall support the project's overall design concept.
- b. Landscaping shall not obstruct visibility of required addressing, nor shall it obstruct the vision of motorists or pedestrians in proximity to the site.
- c. Landscape areas shall be provided in and around parking lots to break up the appearance of large expanses of hardscape.

3. Secondary Functional and Accessory Features.

a. Trash receptacles, storage and loading areas, transformers and mechanical equipment shall be screened in a manner, which is architecturally compatible with the principal building(s).

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

ISSUE 1: Site Plan

Demolition

As a result of the proposed improvements, the existing 3,262 square foot sanctuary building and the existing 3,040 square foot preschool building will be demolished. These two buildings will need to be razed in order to construct the new worship center.

Worship Center

The project proposes the construction of a new worship center building to be located in the same general area as the existing sanctuary and preschool buildings. The new worship center will be approximately 23,000 square feet and will house the new sanctuary with a fixed-seat capacity of 712 seats. The new sanctuary will be located in the bottom center of the project site, south of the existing classroom buildings. The worship center is being built to accommodate the current

worship member population which has outgrown the existing sanctuary and is utilizing the multipurpose building's auditorium for church services. In addition to the sanctuary, conference and meeting rooms, the sacristy, offices, choir and music rooms, storage, child care, and other ancillary/administrative rooms will also be included in the new building. At this time, the applicant is only proposing a conceptual design approval. A separate DRC application along with the site plan review will be submitted for the final design of the proposed worship center and preschool. The final proposal will be consistent with the guidelines in the Specific Plan.

Proposed Vehicular Access and Onsite Circulation

The Salem Specific Plan proposes driveway access off Santiago Canyon Road and retaining the existing access of Frank Lane. The proposed access off Santiago Canyon Road, designed to facilitate eastbound right-turn movements directly into and out of the site, will reduce traffic volume on Frank Lane. A "pork chop" shaped traffic island at the proposed Santiago Canyon Road entry drive will direct traffic flow, accommodate fire truck movement and allow for pedestrian and equestrian crossing. Based on the applicant's traffic engineer's analysis, the proposed Santiago Canyon Road driveway, providing adequate internal circulation and loop movements within the site will ensure that queuing does not extend onto either Santiago Canyon Road or Orange Park Drive during school drop-off and pick-up periods on a typical weekday.

Two drop-off/pick-up areas are proposed. One drop-off/pick-up area will be located in the main parking lot curbside adjacent to the worship center in the form of a "car line." The second dropoff/pick-up area will be located in the parking lot between the existing classroom buildings and the relocated preschool. Parents will park their vehicles in the parking lot and escort their children to and from the preschool building. The proposed design of Frank Lane will reflect a condition of two closely spaced but separate driveways, one for church and school use, and one for residents only which, according to the applicant's traffic engineer, can be provided in a safe and efficient manner. During weekday school drop-off and pick-up periods, two ingress and two egress lanes will be provided. One egress lane will be for right turns onto Orange Park Blvd. and one egress lane will be for left-hand turns onto Orange Park Blvd. During Sunday church services, one ingress and one egress lane will be provided. (Exhibit 4.10 & 4.11 of the Specific Plan or Exhibits 4.8-2 & 4.8-3 of the DEIR).

Proposed Onsite Vehicular Parking

There will be provided onsite 180 paved surface parking spaces and 113 overflow spaces on the multipurpose field to accommodate parking needs on weekdays, Sundays and special events. Per City of Orange Zoning Ordinance 17.34.060 (1 space/4 seats), adequate parking will be provided 100 percent of the time. However, based upon recent surveys and analysis by the project's traffic Engineer, 15 percent of the time a Parking Management Plan (PMP) will be implemented allowing overflow parking to occur on the grass multipurpose field. Events anticipating the need for use of overflow parking on the grass multipurpose field include holiday church services (Easter, Christmas, etc.), school graduations, special school-related events and services (such as opening school year church service, Christmas programs, grandparents day, etc.), occasional funerals and occasional weddings. The overflow parking for such events will not affect the availability of the multipurpose field to student related activities.

Proposed Emergency Access

Emergency access onto the project site would be provided from either of two locations. Frank Lane at Orange Park Boulevard, providing a 26-foot paved travel surface and the Santiago Canyon Road project entry, providing a 30-foot paved travel surface. Emergency access, travel surface widths, and turnaround/hammerhead configurations will meet the City of Orange Fire Department standards.

Offsite Equestrian / Pedestrian / Bicycle Circulation

An existing off-street equestrian trail is located adjacent to the site along Orange Park Boulevard and Santiago Canyon Road. The portion of the equestrian trail located along Santiago Canyon Road terminates where it intersects with the Mara Brandman Horse Arena adjacent to the project site. Equestrian crossing signals are proposed to be installed on both sides of Frank Lane that would require vehicles to stop. Riders approaching Frank Lane from either direction would be able to activate the crossing signal without dismounting. The intersection at Santiago Canyon Road at Orange Park Boulevard is signalized and provides pedestrian push buttons and crosswalks for crossing maneuvers. At the intersection of Orange Park Boulevard and Frank Lane, a crosswalk will be added for pedestrian use across Frank Lane. Santiago Canyon Road and Orange Park Boulevard are designated as Existing Class II (On-Street) bikeways. The bicyclists traveling along Orange Park Boulevard would continue to use the pedestrian crosswalks located at the Frank Lane/Orange Park Boulevard intersections as well as the Santiago Canyon Road/Orange Park Boulevard intersections.

Staff requests that the DRC make a recommendation to the PC regarding the conceptual site plan proposal.

ISSUE 2: Specific Plan Design Guidelines

Specific Plan

The purpose of preparing a Specific Plan for the Salem Lutheran Church and School is to provide a comprehensive development plan for the relocation and redevelopment of existing onsite uses for the property to include the relocation of the preschool to an existing vacant structure on-site and construction of a new worship center building to house the sanctuary, administrative offices and ancillary rooms. The Specific Plan will guide the development of the property and implementation of these proposed improvements, both short-term and long-term, while also addressing infrastructure improvements through Section 6.0 Design Guidelines and Section 7.0 Zoning and Development Regulations/Standards in the Specific Plan. Both sections pertain to the existing and proposed buildings and fall under the DRC purview.

Architecture

Façade changes are not proposed for the existing buildings. The proposed new preschool site will remain primarily as it exists to accommodate the preschool, but the Specific Plan contains guidelines for a reconstruction scenario (such as if the building were destroyed or had other reason to be reconstructed).

The proposed worship center building would reflect contemporary interpretations of the existing architecture in both style and function. *Section 6.3 Worship Center Guidelines* of the Specific Plan address the site planning, play areas, parking, building form and massing, and materials and colors. Should the Specific Plan be approved, a subsequent DRC application will be submitted with the site plan review to address each area for the final design of the worship center.

Section 7.3 Development Standards in the Specific Plan addresses building height, setbacks and parking for the proposed worship center. For instance, the standards limit the height of the proposed worship center to 39 feet while no more that 25% of the roof plane can exceed 32 feet in height. The standards require the worship center to be setback at least 55 feet from Frank lane.

Landscaping

Section 6.4 Landscape Guidelines in the Specific Plan addresses streetscapes, edge treatments, irrigation, and includes a landscape palette. The intent of the landscape design on site is to unify the exterior spaces of the property and to complement the architectural style of the existing/proposed buildings. The applicant has indicated that the landscaping will be used to connect the project contextually to the surrounding OPA community. A plant materials palette has been developed with consideration to the rural characteristics of the OPA and includes both low maintenance plant materials and the efficient use of water.

Fencing and Walls

Section 6.4.6 Walls and Fences in the Specific Plan addresses the onsite fences and walls will be constructed of material, finish, and color that are complimentary to the building architecture to which they relate. Chain link fencing currently exists on the project site located along the campus boundary adjacent to Santiago Canyon Road and Orange Park Boulevard. The applicant has indicated that this fencing would remain in place for the safety of the children in play/recreation areas. However, for safety and security, rolling metal fence/gates will be constructed at all entries to parking lots from the proposed new entry along Santiago Canyon Road and the entry gate at Frank Lane.

At the property line along the west edge of the project, adjacent to the proposed pre-school, the reconstruction of an existing masonry wall is proposed. Due to grade separation, the wall will range in height from 6 to 10 feet depending where along the wall and which side the wall is viewed. The wall shall have a maximum height of 8 feet when measured from the highest elevation of land contiguous to the wall.

Exterior Lighting

Section 6.5 Site Lighting in the Specific Plan addresses sources of exterior lighting on the project site will include parking lot lighting, temporary multipurpose field lighting, and security lighting. A lighting/photometric plan will define the location of light standards and will be submitted to the City at the time of Site Plan review.

Parking lot lighting

Section 6.5.1 Parking Lights in the Specific Plan addresses lighting for paved parking areas and vehicular drive aisles will continue to be provided to assist the congregation, staff, visitors, and

any emergency service vehicles that may be needed with safe, clear, unobstructed way-finding between the adjacent streets and the parking areas. Existing and proposed light sources for the parking lots shall be shielded and adjusted to avoid light overspill.

Temporary Multipurpose field lighting

Section 6.5.2 Multipurpose Field in the Specific Plan addresses lighting for the multipurpose field will occur when used for occasional overflow parking only. At no time will temporary lighting be used to illuminate the multipurpose field for athletic events or other activities. Temporary portable light units will be used to illuminate the area and shall be shielded and adjusted to avoid light overspill. Lighting for overflow parking will operate from dusk until no later than 10:30PM. It is anticipated that overflow parking requiring evening lighting will only occur two or three times a year for events such as Good Friday services and special children's events. Currently the Salem Lutheran Church and School has an overflow parking plan, which specifies the locations on the school's field where vehicles can park.

Security lighting

Section 6.5.3 Safety and Security in the Specific Plan addresses Safety and security lighting for all areas around both existing and proposed buildings will assist with safe, clear, unobstructed way-finding between the adjacent parking areas and the buildings. The style of light fixtures will complement the style of the building architecture and be mounted on building surfaces wherever suitable. Security lighting will be included with the addition of the new worship center and around the preschool, as required and be a combination of existing and new lighting fixtures. All lighting will be indirect, with light sources concealed or shielded from view. Safety and security lighting will operate from dusk until dawn.

Staff requests that the DRC make a recommendation to the PC regarding the Specific Plan design guidelines to establish a context for the future redesign of the campus. Staff requests the DRC address the bulk and mass context for the worship center as well as the site placement.

ISSUE 3: Environmental Impact Report

Environmental Review

The analysis contained in the DEIR determined that implementation of the project may result in significant environmental effects to noise levels in the area without mitigation. CEQA Guidelines requires that mitigation measures be identified for such impacts in an effort to reduce such impacts to a less than significant level and that mitigation be fully enforceable through permit conditions, agreements, or other legally binding instruments. The DEIR includes two mitigation measures, which will be folded into Conditions of Approval that are adopted with the certification of the EIR. Incorporation of the mitigation measures into the project results in a reduction of significant impact to a less than significant level.

The project-level analysis of each topical environmental issue section (DEIR Sections 4.1 through 4.10) is organized into the following sub-sections: Introduction, Environmental Setting, Regulatory Setting, Significance Thresholds, and Project Impacts. The approach to the environmental analysis at the beginning of page 4-1 of the Environmental Analysis Section provides details regarding format and content of each of these sub-sections.

Staff requests that the DRC specifically review Aesthetics Section 4.1 in the DEIR to determine if there are any impacts that may result from the implementation of the proposed project. Based on the analysis in the initial study, significance thresholds deemed to be potentially significant were:

- c) Substantially degrade the existing visual character or quality of the site and its surroundings.
- d) Create a new source of substantial light or glare which would adversely affect day or nighttime views in the area.

Visual Character

Demolition of the existing sanctuary building and preschool building and construction of the new worship center will produce a short-term negative aesthetic impact. These activities are short-term in nature and will cease at the completion of the project. The applicant believes that the project has been designed to minimize the long-term visual impacts to the community. The new worship center and offices are located on an interior portion of the site in the same general location of the aging preschool and sanctuary buildings being razed.

Light or Glare

The visual character of the project site would be temporarily impacted during the short-term site demolition and construction phases of the project. These activities are short-term in nature and will cease at the completion of the project. Impacts would be related to construction vehicles located on the project site, construction materials stored on the site, and site preparation activities that would create daytime glare from these vehicles and materials. The proposed project would result in changes in lighting and glare from the proposed redesign of the new building and use of the multipurpose field for occasional overflow parking of vehicles. Sources of light from the proposed project include: parking lot lighting, temporary multipurpose field lighting, and security lighting. A lighting/photometric plan will define the location of light standards and will be prepared and will be submitted to the City at the time of Site Plan review. The building finishes (masonry and stucco in earth-toned colors) will not lead to glare. Additionally, the roofing system on site will have a matte non-reflective finish.

OPA Aesthetics Policies

Table 4.1-1 in the DEIR provides a comparison of OPA Aesthetics Policies to the Salem Lutheran Church Specific Plan. Based on the applicant's analysis, the Salem Specific Plan is consistent with all the aesthetics policies in OPA.

Based on the analysis, the characteristics of the proposed project are designed to integrate with the existing development surrounding the site. Within the existing site constraints, the site plan includes placement of new structures in the general location of the aging preschool and sanctuary buildings being razed, and design of structures so that they blend in with the existing structures onsite. The landscape elements of the proposed project compliment the surrounding community and will enhance the overall OPA appearance. The landscape design for the proposed project expresses a family of materials, both hardscape and planting, that will serve to unify the exterior spaces of the Salem Lutheran Church property, complement the architectural style of the existing

and proposed buildings, and connect the project contextually to the surrounding OPA community. Development of the project site would not interrupt views of distant hillsides because the project site is relatively flat and because the height of the proposed worship center onsite will be 39 feet at roof peak, which is seven feet above the height allowed by the Zoning Ordinance. No more than 25 percent of the roof plane will exceed 32 feet.

ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

The Staff Review Committee (SRC) reviewed the conceptual plans, specific plan, initial study and draft environmental impact report on multiple occasions. On February 08, 2012, the SRC reviewed the revised documentation and recommended approval with conditions.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a "Finding" as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body "makes a Finding," or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The "Findings" are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC recommend approval to the PC with recommended conditions.

- 1. In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).
 - The project is not located in the Old Towne Historic District; therefore, this Finding does not apply to the application at hand.
- 2. In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2).
 - The project is not located in the National Register Historic District; therefore, this Finding does not apply to the application at hand.
- 3. The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).
 - This Specific Plan, when adopted by ordinance becomes the plan that serves as the zoning ordinance for the subject property. Included in the Specific Plan document are land use regulations, infrastructure plans, zoning and development regulations, design guidelines and implementation measures to ensure that the project will be implemented

in accordance with the goals and objectives established for the project area. All other City codes and ordinances shall continue to be applicable, unless inconsistent with this Specific Plan, in which case they are superseded. Proposed site plans, agreements and any other development approval must be consistent with this Specific Plan.

4. For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character (OMC 17.10.07.F.4).

The project is not infill residential development; therefore, this Finding does not apply to the application at hand.

CONDITIONS

Staff recommends that the DRC recommend approval of the project to the Planning Commission, the DRC may determine that conditions are appropriate to support the required findings and ensure the preservation of community aesthetics.

ATTACHMENTS

- 1. Specific Plan
- 2. Draft Environmental Impact Report
- 3. Proposed Conceptual Plans

cc: Franklyn R. Elfend Elfend & Associates Inc. 18101 Von Karman, Suite 1280 Irvine, CA 92612

> Michael Madden Michael Madden Associates 24795 Eaton Lane Laguna Niguel, CA 92677

Kevin Shannon Michael Brandman Associates 220 Commerce, Suite 200 Irvine, CA 92602