

**CITY OF ORANGE  
DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE  
MINUTES – FINAL**

June 5, 2019

Committee Members Present: Anne McDermott – Chair  
Mary Anne Skorpanich – Vice Chair  
Tim McCormack  
Carol Fox  
Robert Imboden

Staff in Attendance: Marissa Moshier, Historic Preservation Planner  
Ashley Brodtkin, Associate Planner  
Kelly Ribuffo, Associate Planner  
Jessica Wang, Administrative Specialist

**Administrative Session – 5:10 p.m.**

Chair McDermott opened the Administrative Session at 5:10 p.m.

Marissa Moshier, Historic Preservation Planner, stated that, effective in July, the Design Review Committee meeting agenda will be modified to eliminate the administrative session to be consistent with the organization of City Council and Planning Commission agendas. Committee Members shall submit any changes and revisions to the minutes directly to staff for approval at a future meeting. A section will be added to the agenda in order to allow conversation on topics that the Committee would like to discuss. The meeting will still commence at 5:00 p.m.

Ms. Moshier stated the meeting scheduled for July 3, 2019 will be canceled due to the City's July 3rd festivities. The June 19, 2019 meeting will adjourn to July 10, 2019.

The Committee provided edits to the May 15, 2019 meeting minutes.

Chair McDermott adjourned the administrative session at 5:30 p.m.

**Regular Session – 5:31 p.m.**

**ROLL CALL:**

Committee Members McDermott, Skorpanich, Imboden, McCormack, and Fox were present.

**FLAG SALUTE:**

Vice Chair Skorpanich led the flag salute.

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION:**

Opportunity for Members of the public to address the Design Review Committee on matters not listed on the Agenda.

There were no speakers.

**CONSENT ITEMS:**

(1) APPROVAL OF MINUTES: May 15, 2019

Committee Member Skorpanich made a motion to approve the May 15, 2019 minutes as emended during the Administrative Session.

SECOND: Imboden  
AYES: McCormack, McDermott, Fox, Skorpanich, and Imboden  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**AGENDA ITEMS:**

**Continued Items: None**

(2) Design Review No. 4952-18 - CATLIN CULVER RESIDENCE

- A proposal to reconstruct a demolished service porch and make other exterior alterations to an existing single-family residence. Third review by DRC.
- 585 E. Culver Avenue
- Staff Contact: Kelly Ribuffo, (714) 744-7223, kribuffo@cityoforange.org
- DRC Action: Final Determination

Kelly Ribuffo, Associate Planner, provided an overview of the project consistent with the staff report.

Chair McDermott opened the public comment portion of the meeting.

Jeff Frankel, Old Towne Preservation Association, spoke in opposition of the windows and commented that the stucco finish on the service porch should be smooth.

The Committee had comments and questions on the following:

- The size of the replacement windows.
- The stucco finish on the reconstruction, confirming that a sand finish is historically appropriate.
- The need to correct the wording of the window schedule to reflect the installation of a pair of windows.
- The stucco mould detail on sheet D2 of the plans.
- Confirmation of the front window style as two over one based on photographic evidence presented at a previous Design Review meeting.

Committee Member Fox made a motion to approve Design Review No. 4952 – 18 – Caitlin Culver Residence based on the findings and conditions in the staff report with the additional conditions as follows:

- That the window schedule be corrected as outlined in the discussion.
- For the windows on the front of the house, the double hung windows on either side of the central panel shall have two lights over one instead of three over one.

SECOND: McDermott  
AYES: McCormack, McDermott, Fox, Skorpanich, and Imboden  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**New Agenda Items:**

(3) Design Review No. 4967-19 – MARTIN RESIDENCE

- A proposal to rehabilitate the front porch and construct a 333 square foot addition to the rear of a contributing single-family residence in the Old Towne Historic District.
- 425 E. Sycamore Avenue
- Staff Contact: Kelly Ribuffo, (714) 744-7223, kribuffo@Cityoforange.org
- DRC Action: Final Determination

Kelly Ribuffo, Associate Planner provided an overview of the front porch rehabilitation and room addition consistent with the staff report.

Chair McDermott opened the public hearing.

Jeff Frankel, Old Towne Preservation Association, expressed support for the project and suggested design modifications for the front porch. He also commented on the gable vent and placement of the HVAC unit.

Committee members had questions and comments on the following:

- The water heater closet and related ventilation options in consideration of door aesthetics.
- The need for more detail in the front porch attic vent callout.
- The proportion and placement of the window on the back elevation.
- The doors should match the style depicted on the elevations and not the cut sheet.
- The need to review the front porch gable end details prior to the issuance of a building permit.
- The siding key notes.

Committee Member Fox made a motion to approve DRC No. 4967-19 – Martin Residence based on the findings and conditions in the staff report with the following additional conditions:

- The detailing of the gable end on the front porch shall return to the DRC for review prior to issuance of a building permit.

- The window on the rear elevation shall be changed to a casement window that is more in proportion to the other window in that room that is to be reviewed by staff.
- Sheet A3.10, keynote 3 shall read "existing clapboard siding". Keynote 4 shall be changed to "new shiplap siding" per detail 6/A5.10. The keynote on A3.10 that refers to the roofing on the front porch shall be revised so that it reflects new roofing to match existing.
- The doors in the new addition shall be constructed per the drawings, not per the cut sheet provided to the DRC; if the applicant requests to change the front door, the doors shall return to the DRC prior to issuance of a building permit along with the front porch.
- Sheet A3.10 should be revised to conform with the demo keynote 4 on sheet A2.00 to reflect that the door shall be salvaged for reuse.
- The water heater closet shall be vented through the floor and not through the door.

SECOND: Skorpanich  
AYES: McCormack, Skorpanich, McDermott, Imboden, and Fox  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**RECESS:** 6:34 - 6:46 p.m.

(4) Design Review No. 4970-19 – ORANGE SENIOR HOUSING

- A proposal to demolish a three-story vacant office building and construct 74 senior affordable apartments on a site of 1.54 acres. Concessions and waivers are requested under state affordable housing for exceeding height, number of stories, and wall requirements.
- 1249 E. Katella Avenue
- Staff Contact: Ashley Brodtkin, (714) 744-7238, abrodtkin@Cityoforange.org
- DRC Action: Recommendation to the Planning Commission

Ashley Brodtkin, Associate Planner, provided an overview of the project consistent with the staff report.

Paul Abbondante, volunteer treasurer for Orange Senior Housing Incorporated, provided a visual presentation of the project consisting of physical characteristics, circulation, location, pedestrian access, outreach, variance requests and project specifications.

Chair McDermott and Vice Chair Skorpanich disclosed that they met with the project applicant prior to this meeting.

Chair McDermott opened the public hearing.

Kevin Anderson, owner of TusKatella Shopping Center, spoke in opposition to the project due to site circulation.

Joyce Hays, a nearby resident, spoke in opposition and expressed concerns about:

- Loss of privacy.
- Preservation or replacement of the aging block wall.
- Building separation from the neighborhood.
- The location and contents of the dumpster.
- The project height.

Committee members had comments and questions on the following:

- The height of the masonry wall and landscape screening for the neighborhood.
- The need to break up the front façade and create a focal point. An H-shaped building instead of U-shape may be more suitable.
- Stairwell illumination and visibility to the homes in the rear.
- The sparseness of the landscaping.
- The front setbacks and sloping landscape in front of the building.
- Clarification of how concessions and waivers are granted to affordable housing projects.
- The trash enclosures.
- The roof plans being inconsistent with the elevations.
- The onsite drainage and the retention basin.
- Stair wells, balconies and windows in the rear of the property with line of sight impacts.
- The visibility of gas meters upon entry.
- The approach sequence to enter the property. It is very difficult for visitors to find the entrance from Katella.
- The mass and size of the building and façade.
- The lack of outdoor space.
- The lack of alley lighting.
- The limited exterior lighting on the California Street side and two tall light standards close to the back fence which will impose on the neighbors.
- The need for broader sensitivity about the way the project impacts the neighbors.

Gary Frazier of Orange Senior Housing responded to the various comments.

He explained a provision in the Code pertaining to building setbacks and parallel walls.

He explained there are 16-20' Brisbane box trees along the existing 6' wall, which will be preserved for the privacy of the residences. They feel it is more important to preserve the trees rather than replace the wall or add an additional two feet to the height of the wall.

He expressed a willingness to work with staff to come up with the criteria on the stairwell windows on the north side.

The Committee discussed the lack of a lighting plan and photometric study. Mr. Frazier explained that their project is at the entitlement phase so more detailed plans have not yet been developed.

The Committee advised the applicant that the City does not have a different process for the entitlement phase and they do not feel that they are ready to move the project forward to the Planning Commission.

Committee member Imboden advised the applicant he was willing to make a motion for a continuance.

Chair McDermott explained the options for a continuance or whether or not the applicant wants the Committee to make their recommendation to the Planning Commission.

Mr. Frazier asked for a brief recess in order to discuss it with the team.

**RECESS:** 9:25 - 9:39 p.m.

Mr. Frazier returned and stated the team did not want to continue the item and would like a decision on the item.

Committee Member Fox made a motion for a recommendation of denial to the Planning Commission for Design Review Number 4970 – 19, Orange Senior Housing.

SECOND: Imboden  
AYES: McCormack, Skorpanich, McDermott, Imboden, and Fox  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ADJOURNMENT:**

Chair McDermott adjourned the meeting at 9:32 PM. She noted the regular scheduled meeting set for July 3, 2019 will be canceled.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, June 19, 2019.